

Comparison of Climate Accountability Advisory Board Frameworks

Researched and compiled by **Nick Zrinyi**, Policy Analyst

The contents of this document are valid as of July 2021 and are for information purposes only. Nothing in this document should be construed as legal or professional advice and you may not rely on the contents of this document as such.

Legend of color coding: on a spectrum from minimum standards (white/light green) to darker shades of green representing best practices

	Independence <i>Stated in law?</i>	Expertise Requirement	Membership <i>Number of members, term + opportunity for renewal, reasons for removal</i>	Secretariat and Budget <i>Number of staff and who provides it</i>	Internal Rules <i>Who decides internal rules of the committee?</i>	Reporting <i>Types of reports & Content determined by law? Public? Require government response?</i>	Mandate <i>Roles and functions determined by law?</i>
Canada 🇨🇦 <i>Net-Zero Advisory Body</i> Canadian Net-Zero Emissions Accountability Act (2021) Text of Act	The Act specifies that the committee “provide the Minister with independent advice”	Minister must consider a list of expertise requirements for the advisory body as a whole.	15 Members maximum on a part time basis. 3-year term with 1 renewal. Members are appointed by Governor in Council on recommendation of Minister who also designates the two co-chairs.	No mention of secretariat or budget.	Minister determines and can amend Terms of Reference.	Annual report to minister with respect to its advice and activities. Report must take into account a range of factors. The Minister must make the advisory body’s report public and respond publicly to the advice.	Mandate prescribed in the Bill: Provide advice with respect to emissions targets, emissions reductions plans, and other matters referred to it by Minister. The body can also conduct engagement activities.
UK 🇬🇧 <i>Climate Change Committee</i> Act (2008) Schedule 1 Text of Act	No mention of independence.	Detailed list of expertise requirements e.g. climate science, policy, economics and subnational governments.	5 to 8 members and 1 chair. 2-, 4-, or 5-year terms. Appointed by National Authorities. Can only be removed for specified reasons (absence, bankrupt, unfit according to govt).	Committee-appointed secretariat (currently 30-35 staff, though not prescribed by the Act) Budget is not mentioned in act, but for 2018 was \$6.4 million (there is probably an updated one).	Committee can regulate its own procedure.	Annual report about its functions and ability to report on advice tabled in Parliament. Action plans every 5 years. Government must respond to reports.	Mandate is prescribed in the law in the form of a list of items that the government can request advice on.

	Independence <i>Stated in law?</i>	Expertise Requirement	Membership <i>Number of members, term + opportunity for renewal, reasons for removal</i>	Secretariat and Budget <i>Number of staff and who provides it</i>	Internal Rules <i>Who decides internal rules of the committee?</i>	Reporting <i>Types of reports & Content determined by law? Public? Require government response?</i>	Mandate <i>Roles and functions determined by law?</i>
France  <i>Haut conseil pour le climat</i> Decree (May 19th, 2019) Loi 2019 relative à l'énergie et au climat Text of Decree	The council is independent and must be free of conflicts of interest, entire section dedicated to this.	Detailed list of expertise requirements.	12 members and 1 chair. 5-year term with 1 renewal. Members are appointed by decree.	Secretariat is under the authority of the chair of the council. The law specifically mentions an autonomous budget (Their budget is around \$3 million CAD per year, administered by the chair of the council).	Council regulates its own procedure.	Council reports each year on compliance, effectiveness, and socio-economic impacts. Government must respond to this report within 6 months.	Mandate is prescribed in the law. Parliaments can request advice from the committee and committee can issue advice on its own initiatives in addition to yearly reports.
New Zealand  <i>Climate Change Commission Act</i> (2019) Part 1A Text of Act	Independence stated in the Act.	Detailed expertise requirements stated in the act, including expertise in indigenous treaties, knowledge, language, customs and protocols.	5 members, 1 deputy chair, and 1 chair. Members are nominated by a nominating committee that is appointed by the Minister.	No mention of secretariat or budget.	No information on internal rules. *One unique aspect of this Act is the requirement for the commission to consult the public when undertaking its duties.	Only provides advice, reports, or assessments at the request of the government. All reports, including advice, etc are made public.	Mandate, or “purposes of commission” are prescribed in the law – to provide advice and monitor and review progress. The Law also lays out a detailed list of the committees’ “functions”.
Germany  <i>Council of Experts on Climate Change Act</i> (2019) Text of Act	Independence stated in the Act.	Detailed expertise requirements stated in the act, including a requirement for “overarching expertise”.	5 members with 5-year terms with 1 reappointment. Members are appointed by the government. Chair is elected by the council.	Secretariat is appointed by the government, but under the authority of the council. Government will cover the costs incurred by the council, no specific amount given.	“The Council of Experts on Climate Change shall adopt its own rules of procedure.”	Must assess emissions data assess GHG data, examine assumptions, advise on budget changes, assesses effectiveness in emergency measures proposal should sector miss budget, plan updates. Government under an obligation to obtain opinion from council before certain decisions.	Mandate specified in law – Parliament can request special reports.

	Independence <i>Stated in law?</i>	Expertise Requirement	Membership <i>Number of members, term + opportunity for renewal, reasons for removal</i>	Secretariat and Budget <i>Number of staff and who provides it</i>	Internal Rules <i>Who decides internal rules of the committee?</i>	Reporting <i>Types of reports & Content determined by law? Public? Require government response?</i>	Mandate <i>Roles and functions determined by law?</i>
Denmark 🇩🇰 <i>Council on Climate Change Act (2020)</i> Text of Act	Independence stated in the Act.	Detailed expertise requirements stated in the act.	8 members and 1 chair. 4-year terms with 1 reappointment. Members are elected by the council and appointed by the Minister.	The secretariat consists of 24 employees and its “head” is appointed by the chair of the council. No information on budget.	“The Danish Council on Climate Change determines its rules of procedure.”	Annual report that includes recommendations to the Minister, assessment of efforts, status update on international targets. No requirement to make reports public.	No clear mandate other than reporting requirements.
California 🇺🇸 <i>Independent Emissions Market Advisory Committee</i> California Code 38591.2 Text of Code	Independence is stated in the code.	Detailed expertise requirements stated in the act.	5 members: Three appointed by the Governor, one appointed by the State Senate, and one appointed by the State Legislative Assembly.	No information on secretariat or budget.	No information on internal rules.	They “report on the environmental and economic performance of the regulation adopted by the state board pursuant to subdivision (c) of Section 38562 and other relevant climate policies.” No requirement to make reports public.	No clear mandate other than reporting requirements.
Quebec 🇨🇦 <i>Expert Advisory Council Climate Change Act (2020)</i> Text of Act	Independence stated in the Act. Members must also be free of conflicts of interest.	Significant and multidisciplinary expertise requirements, majority are required to be from scientific community.	9 to 12 members. 3-year term with 1 renewal. The Government appoints the committee chair after consulting the chief scientist. The government then appoints members from among a list generated by chair and chief scientist.	Secretariat is appointed by government. Members are not paid, except for reimbursements.	“The committee may make any by-law concerning the exercise of its functions and its internal management.”	No reporting except for advice given to Minister. Advice is made public.	Mandate is provided and only includes provision of advice to Minister.

Note: Table does not include Sweden, Norway, Netherlands, Mexico, Pakistan, Spain (proposed, not passed), Ireland, and Wales as well as many Canadian provinces which all also have advisory councils.

Detailed Comparison - Text of Bill/Act/Decree by Country

Canada

Independence

20 (1) There is established an advisory body, called the Net-Zero Advisory Body, whose mandate is to provide the Minister with independent advice with respect to achieving net-zero emissions by 2050, including advice respecting [...]

Expertise Requirement

Minister's recommendation

(1.1) When making a recommendation, the Minister must consider the need for the advisory body as a whole to have expertise in, or knowledge of,

- a) climate change science, including the environmental, ecological, social, economic and distributional effects of climate change;
- b) Indigenous knowledge;
- c) other relevant physical and social sciences, including economic analysis and forecasting;
- d) climate change and climate policy at the national, subnational and international levels, including the likely effects and efficacy of potential responses to climate change;
- e) energy supply and demand; and
- f) relevant technologies.

Membership

Appointment and remuneration of members

21 (1) The Governor in Council appoints the members of the advisory body on the recommendation of the Minister and fixes their remuneration. [...]

Composition of body

(2) The advisory body is composed of no more than fifteen members, who are appointed on a part-time basis for a renewable term of up to three years.

Co-chairs

(3) The Governor in Council, on the recommendation of the minister, designates two co-chairs from among the members appointed under subsection (1).

Reimbursement of expenses

(4) The members are entitled to be reimbursed, in accordance with Treasury Board directives, for the travel, living and other expenses incurred in connection with their work for the advisory body while absent from their ordinary place of residence.

Deemed employment

(5) Members of the advisory body are deemed to be employed in the federal public administration for the purposes of the Government Employees Compensation Act and any regulations made under section 9 of the Aeronautics Act.

Internal Rules

Terms of reference

(2) The Minister may determine and amend the terms of reference of the advisory body and must make any terms of reference or amendments to those terms available to the public.

Reporting

Report

22 (1) The advisory body must submit an annual report to the Minister with respect to its advice and activities, including setting out the result of its engagement activities.

Factors

(1.1) When providing its advice and preparing its report, the advisory body must take into account a range of factors, to the extent they are relevant to the purpose of this Act including environmental, economic, social and technological and the best available scientific information and knowledge, including Indigenous knowledge, respecting climate change.

Minister's response

(2) The Minister must make the annual report available to the public within 30 days after receiving it and then, within 120 days after receiving the report, the Minister must publicly respond to the advice that the advisory body includes in it with respect to the matters referred to in paragraphs 20(1)(a) to (c), including any national greenhouse gas emissions target that is recommended by the advisory body if the Minister has set a target that is different from it.

Mandate

Establishment and mandate

20 (1) There is established an advisory body whose mandate is to provide the Minister with advice with respect to achieving net-zero emissions by 2050, including advice respecting measures and sectoral strategies that the Government of Canada could implement to achieve a greenhouse gas emissions target, and any matter referred to it by the Minister, and to conduct engagement activities related to achieving net-zero emissions.

[⏪ Return to top](#)

UK 

Expertise Requirement

(3) In appointing a member, the national authorities must have regard to the desirability of securing that the Committee (taken as a whole) has experience in or knowledge of the following—

- a) business competitiveness;
- b) climate change policy at national and international level, and in particular the social impacts of such policy;
- c) climate science, and other branches of environmental science;
- d) differences in circumstances between England, Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland and the capacity of national authorities to take action in relation to climate change;
- e) economic analysis and forecasting;
- f) emissions trading;
- g) energy production and supply;
- h) financial investment;
- i) technology development and diffusion.

Membership

(1) The Committee shall consist of—

- a) a person appointed by the national authorities to chair the Committee (“the chair”), and
- b) not less than five and not more than eight other members appointed by the national authorities.

The national authorities may remove a member—

- a) who has been absent from meetings of the Committee without its permission for a period of 6 months or more,
- b) who has become bankrupt or has made an arrangement with creditors,
- c) whose estate has been sequestrated in Scotland or who, under Scots law, has made a composition or arrangement with, or granted a trust deed for, creditors, or
- d) who in the opinion of the national authorities is otherwise unable or unfit to carry out the duties of that member.

Secretariat and Budget

(1) The Committee must appoint a person to be chief executive, but may only appoint a person who has been approved by the national authorities.

(2) The chief executive is an employee of the Committee.

The Committee may appoint other employees.

The Committee must, if required to do so by the national authorities—

- a) pay such pensions, gratuities or allowances as the national authorities may determine to or in respect of any employee or former employee, or
- b) pay such sums as the national authorities may determine towards provision for the payment of pensions, gratuities or allowances to or in respect of any employee or former employee.

Internal Rules

The Committee may regulate—

- a) its own procedure (including quorum), and
- b) the procedure of any sub-committee (including quorum).

Reporting

1. For each financial year the Committee must—

- a) prepare an annual report on the discharge of its functions during the year, and
- b) send a copy to the national authorities within such period as the national authorities may direct.

(2) A copy of each report received under this paragraph must be laid—

- a) by the Secretary of State before Parliament,
- b) by the Scottish Ministers before the Scottish Parliament,
- c) by the Welsh Ministers before the National Assembly for Wales, and
- d) by the relevant Northern Ireland department before the Northern Ireland Assembly.

In this Schedule “financial year” means—

- a) the period beginning with the day the Committee is established and ending with the next 31st March, and
- b) each subsequent period of 12 months ending with 31st March.

(1) The Committee must keep proper accounts and proper records in relation to the accounts.

(2) For each financial year the Committee must—

- a) prepare a statement of accounts in respect of that financial year, and
- b) send a copy of the statement to the national authorities and the Comptroller and Auditor General within such period as the national authorities direct.

(3) The statement must be in such form as the national authorities may direct.

(4) The Comptroller and Auditor General must—

- a) examine, certify and report on the statement, and
- b) send a copy of the certified statement and the report to the national authorities as soon as possible.

(5) A copy of each statement received under sub-paragraph (4) must be laid—

- a) by the Secretary of State before Parliament,
- b) by the Scottish Ministers before the Scottish Parliament,

- c) by the Welsh Ministers before the National Assembly for Wales, and
- d) by the relevant Northern Ireland department before the Northern Ireland Assembly.

Mandate

- (1) The Committee must provide the national authorities with such information as they may request about its property.
- (2) The Committee must provide the Secretary of State with such information as the Secretary of State may request about the exercise or proposed exercise of its functions under—
 - a) Part 1 (carbon target and budgeting),
 - b) section 33 (advice on level of 2050 target),
 - c) section 34 (advice in connection with carbon budgets),
 - d) section 35 (advice on emissions from international aviation and international shipping),
 - e) section 36 (reports on progress),
 - f) section 57 (advice on report on impact of climate change), or
 - g) section 59 (reporting on progress in connection with adaptation).
- (3) The Committee must provide a national authority with such information as the national authority may request about the exercise or proposed exercise of the Committee's functions under—
 - a) section 38 (duty to provide advice or assistance on request), or
 - b) section 48 (advice on trading scheme regulations),in relation to that national authority. If the information relates to the exercise or proposed exercise of those functions in relation to two or more national authorities, the request must be made by all of them jointly.
- (4) The Committee must provide the national authorities with such information as they may request about the exercise or proposed exercise of any of its other functions.
- (5) The Committee must also—
 - a) permit any person authorised by a national authority to inspect and make copies of any accounts or other documents of the Committee, and
 - b) provide such explanation of them as that person or the national authority may require.
- (6) Before exercising a function under sub-paragraph (5), the national authority must consult the other national authorities.

[⏪ Return to top](#)

France

Independence

Art. D. 132-1.-Le Haut Conseil pour le climat, organisme indépendant, est placé auprès du Premier ministre.

[...]

Dans l'exercice de leurs missions au titre du Haut Conseil pour le climat, les membres du Haut Conseil pour le climat ne peuvent solliciter ou recevoir aucune instruction du Gouvernement ou de toute autre personne publique ou privée.

Expertise Requirement

Outre son président, le Haut Conseil pour le climat comprend au plus douze membres choisis en raison de leur expertise scientifique, technique et économique dans le domaine des sciences du climat et de la réduction des émissions de gaz à effet de serre.

Membership

Outre son président, le Haut Conseil pour le climat comprend au plus douze membres choisis en raison de leur expertise scientifique, technique et économique dans le domaine des sciences du climat et de la réduction des émissions de gaz à effet de serre.

Les membres sont nommés par décret.

La durée du mandat est de cinq ans, renouvelable une fois. Lorsqu'un membre cesse ses fonctions, il est nommé un nouveau membre pour la durée du mandat restant à accomplir, après avis du président du Haut Conseil pour le climat.

Secretariat and Budget

Art. D. 132-7.-Le Haut Conseil pour le climat est un organisme indépendant, hébergé par France Stratégie qui met à sa disposition un appui administratif, informatique et de communication.

Le Haut Conseil pour le climat dispose d'un budget propre. Son président décide de l'emploi des crédits nécessaires à l'accomplissement de ses missions.

Le haut conseil dispose d'un secrétariat qui assure, sous l'autorité de son président, le suivi et l'organisation de ses travaux.

Pour la réalisation de ses missions, le haut conseil peut solliciter l'appui des services de l'administration compétents en matière de climat, avec leur accord. Il peut également passer commande de travaux ou études à des experts ou des organismes extérieurs à l'administration.

Internal Rules

Art. D. 132-5.-Le Haut Conseil pour le climat établit et rend public son règlement intérieur, qui précise notamment ses règles de fonctionnement et les conditions dans lesquelles son président peut déléguer ses attributions.

Reporting

Art. D. 132-2.-Le Haut Conseil pour le climat rend chaque année un rapport qui porte notamment sur :

1. Le respect de la trajectoire de baisse des émissions de gaz à effet de serre, eu égard aux budgets carbone définis en application de l'article L. 222-1 A du code de l'environnement ;

2. La mise en œuvre et l'efficacité des politiques et mesures décidées par l'Etat et les collectivités locales pour réduire les émissions de gaz à effet de serre, développer les puits de carbone, réduire l'empreinte carbone et développer l'adaptation au changement climatique, y compris les dispositions budgétaires et fiscales.
3. L'impact socio-économique et environnemental, y compris pour la biodiversité, de ces différentes politiques publiques.

Dans ce rapport, le haut conseil met en perspective les engagements et les actions de la France par rapport à ceux des autres pays. Il émet des recommandations et propositions pour améliorer l'action de la France.

Ce rapport est remis au Premier ministre et transmis au Parlement et au Conseil économique, social et environnemental.

Les suites données par le Gouvernement à ce rapport sont présentées au Parlement et au Conseil économique, social et environnemental dans un délai de six mois à compter de sa remise.

Art. D. 132-3.-Le Haut Conseil pour le climat rend un avis sur la stratégie nationale bas-carbone et les budgets carbone ainsi que sur le rapport mentionné au II de l'article L. 222-1 D du code de l'environnement. Il évalue la cohérence de la stratégie bas-carbone vis-à-vis des politiques nationales et des engagements européens et internationaux de la France, en particulier de l'Accord de Paris et de l'atteinte de la neutralité carbone en 2050, tout en prenant en compte les impacts sociaux-économiques de la transition pour les ménages et les entreprises, les enjeux de souveraineté et les impacts environnementaux.

Art. D. 132-4.-Le Haut Conseil pour le climat peut être saisi par le Gouvernement, le président de l'Assemblée nationale, le président du Sénat ou à sa propre initiative, pour rendre un rapport sur des questions sectorielles, relatives au financement des mesures de mise en œuvre de la stratégie nationale bas-carbone ou à la mise en œuvre territoriale des politiques climatiques.

Art. D. 132-6.-Tous les avis et rapports du Haut Conseil pour le climat sont rendus publics sur son site internet.

Mandate

Art. D. 132-3.-Le Haut Conseil pour le climat rend un avis sur la stratégie nationale bas-carbone et les budgets carbone ainsi que sur le rapport mentionné au II de l'article L. 222-1 D du code de l'environnement. Il évalue la cohérence de la stratégie bas-carbone vis-à-vis des politiques nationales et des engagements européens et internationaux de la France, en particulier de l'Accord de Paris et de l'atteinte de la neutralité carbone en 2050, tout en prenant en compte les impacts sociaux-économiques de la transition pour les ménages et les entreprises, les enjeux de souveraineté et les impacts environnementaux.

Art. D. 132-4.-Le Haut Conseil pour le climat peut être saisi par le Gouvernement, le président de l'Assemblée nationale, le président du Sénat ou à sa propre initiative, pour rendre un rapport sur des questions sectorielles, relatives au financement des mesures de mise en œuvre de la stratégie nationale bas-carbone ou à la mise en œuvre territoriale des politiques climatiques.

[⏪ Return to top](#)

New Zealand

Independence

5O Commission must act independently

- (1) The Commission must act independently in performing its functions and duties and exercising its powers under this Act.
- (2) However, the Minister may direct the Commission to have regard to Government policy for the purposes of the Commission—
- a) recommending unit supply settings of the New Zealand emissions trading scheme; and
 - b) providing advice about New Zealand’s nationally determined contributions under the Paris Agreement (in a report requested under section 5K).

Expertise Requirement

5H Matters Minister must have regard to before recommending appointment of member of Commission

- (1) Before recommending the appointment of a member of the Commission, the Minister must have regard to the need for the Commission to have members who, collectively, have—
- a) an understanding of climate change mitigation and adaptation, including the likely effects of any responses to climate change; and
 - b) experience working in or with local and central government; and
 - c) knowledge of the process by which public and regulatory policy is formed and given effect to; and
 - d) technical and professional skills, experience, and expertise in, and an understanding of innovative approaches relevant to,—
 - i. the environmental, ecological, social, economic, and distributional effects of climate change and climate change policy interventions; and
 - ii. the Treaty of Waitangi (Te Tiriti o Waitangi) and te ao Māori (including tikanga Māori, te reo Māori, mātauranga Māori, and Māori economic activity); and
 - iii. a range of sectors and industries, at regional and local levels.

- (2) In this section,—

mātauranga Māori means traditional Māori knowledge

te ao Māori means the Māori world

te reo Māori means the Māori language

tikanga Māori means Māori custom and protocol.

Membership

5D Membership of Commission

- (1) The Commission consists of—
- a) a Chairperson;
 - b) a Deputy Chairperson;

c) 5 other members.

(2) The members of the Commission are a board for the purposes of the Crown Entities Act 2004.

5E Process for appointment of members of Commission

(1) The Minister may recommend to the Governor-General that a person be appointed a member of the Commission if—

- a) the person has been nominated by the nominating committee; and
- b) the Minister has had regard to the matters in section 5H; and
- c) the Minister has consulted representatives of all political parties in Parliament.

(2) The Minister may, at any time, recommend to the Governor-General that a current member of the Commission be appointed to the position of Chairperson or Deputy Chairperson of the Commission.

5F Establishment and membership of nominating committee

(1) The Minister must establish a committee to nominate candidates to the Minister for appointment as members of the Commission.

(2) The nominating committee must comprise—

- a) the Chairperson of the Commission; and
- b) 4 or more other people who, in the opinion of the Minister, have the relevant skills or experience to identify suitably qualified candidates.

(3) If the position of Chairperson is vacant, the nominating committee must comprise 5 or more people who, in the opinion of the Minister, have the relevant skills or experience to identify suitably qualified candidates.

5G Role of nominating committee

(1) On request of the Minister, the nominating committee must nominate 1 or more people who, in the opinion of the committee, are suitably qualified to be appointed to be members of the Commission.

(2) Before nominating a person for appointment, the nominating committee must—

- a) publicly call for expressions of interest in being appointed; and
- b) consult any person or group who may have an interest in being a member of the Commission, including—
 - i. iwi and Māori representative organisations; and
 - ii. any person or group that the Minister has identified as having an interest.

5I Members' term of office

In recommending the appointment of a member of the Commission, the Minister must recommend a term of office that ensures that no more than 2 members have their terms of office expire in any calendar year.

Internal Rules

5M Matters Commission must consider

In performing its functions and duties and exercising its powers under this Act, the Commission must consider, where relevant,—

- a) current available scientific knowledge; and
- b) existing technology and anticipated technological developments, including the costs and benefits of early adoption of these in New Zealand; and
- c) the likely economic effects; and
- d) social, cultural, environmental, and ecological circumstances, including differences between sectors and regions; and
- e) the distribution of benefits, costs, and risks between generations; and
- f) the Crown-Māori relationship, te ao Māori (as defined in section 5H(2)), and specific effects on iwi and Māori; and
- g) responses to climate change taken or planned by parties to the Paris Agreement or to the Convention.

Reporting

5K Reports to Government

(1) The Minister may, at any time, request that the Commission prepare reports to the Government on matters related to reducing emissions of greenhouse gases and adapting to the effects of climate change.

(2) Before making a request, the Minister must consult the Commission about the terms of reference for the requested report, which may, without limitation, specify—

- a) the scope of the report; and
- b) requirements concerning consultation; and
- c) matters relating to the Commission working jointly with other agencies (including overseas agencies) concerned with the subject matter of the report; and
- d) the date by which the Commission must submit its report to the Minister.

(3) On receiving a request from the Minister, the Commission must,—

- a) as soon as practicable, make the terms of reference publicly available; and
- b) prepare a report in accordance with the terms of reference; and
- c) provide the report to the Minister.

5L Tabling and publication of Commission's reports

(1) This section applies in respect of a document (such as advice, a report, a recommendation, or an assessment) provided to the Minister by the Commission under this Act.

(2) The Minister must present a copy of the document to the House of Representatives by the later of—

- a) 10 working days after the document is provided to the Minister; and
- b) if Parliament is not in session during the 10 working days after the document is provided to the Minister, as soon as practicable after the commencement of the next session of Parliament.

(3) The Commission must make the document publicly available as soon as practicable after it is presented to the House of Representatives, but no later than 20 working days after providing it to the Minister (even if the document has not been presented to the House by that date).

Consultation

5N Consultation

(1) In performing its functions and duties and exercising its powers under this Act, the Commission must—

- a) proactively engage with persons the Commission considers relevant to the functions, duties, and powers; and
- b) where the Commission considers it is necessary, provide for participation by the public.

(2) The Commission may—

- a) publish and invite submissions on discussion papers and draft reports; and
- b) undertake any other type of consultation that it considers necessary for the performance of its functions and duties under this Act.

Mandate

5J Commission's functions

The functions of the Commission are—

- a) to review the 2050 target and, if necessary, recommend changes to the target (see sections 5R to 5T):
- b) to provide advice to the Minister to enable the preparation of emissions budgets (see section 5ZA):
- c) to recommend any necessary amendments to emissions budgets (see section 5ZE):
- d) to provide advice to the Minister about the quantity of emissions that may be banked or borrowed between 2 adjacent emissions budget periods (see section 5ZF):
- e) to provide advice to the Minister to enable the preparation of an emissions reduction plan (see section 5ZH):
- f) to monitor and report on progress towards meeting emissions budgets and the 2050 target (see sections 5ZJ to 5ZL):
- g) to prepare national climate change risk assessments (see section 5ZQ):
- h) to prepare reports on the implementation of the national adaptation plan (see section 5ZU):
- i) to provide other reports requested by the Minister (see section 5K).

[⏪ Return to top](#)

Germany

Independence

(3) The Council of Experts on Climate Change shall be bound only by the mandate assigned by this Act and shall be independent in its activity. [...]

Expertise Requirement

(1) A Council of Experts on Climate Change shall be established, comprising five specialised persons from various disciplines. The Federal Government shall appoint the members for a term of five years, **at least one member being drawn from each of the fields of climatology, economics, environmental science and social matters and possessing outstanding scientific knowledge and experience in his or her field. The Council of Experts as a whole shall also embody overarching expertise in the sectors specified in section 4 subsection (1) of this Act.** Equal representation of women and men shall be ensured. Each member may be reappointed once.

Membership

(1) A Council of Experts on Climate Change shall be established, comprising **five specialised persons** from various disciplines. **The Federal Government shall appoint the members for a term of five years,** at least one member being drawn from each of the fields of climatology, economics, environmental science and social matters and possessing outstanding scientific knowledge and experience in his or her field. The Council of Experts as a whole shall also embody overarching expertise in the sectors specified in section 4 subsection (1) of this Act. **Equal representation of women and men shall be ensured. Each member may be reappointed once.**

Secretariat and Budget

(3) [...] The Federation shall meet the costs incurred by the Council of Experts on Climate Change, subject to the provisions of the federal budget.

(4) The Council of Experts on Climate Change shall be assisted in the performance of its work by an administrative office. The staff of the office shall be appointed by the Federal Government and shall be under the authority of the Council of Experts on Climate Change in professional matters.

Internal Rules

(5) The Federal Government is authorised to enact statutory instruments not requiring the consent of the Bundesrat to lay down rules governing the seat of the Council of Experts on Climate Change, its administrative office, the lump-sum remuneration of its members, the reimbursement of their travel expenses, their duty of confidentiality and other organisational matters.

Reporting

(1) The Council of Experts on Climate Change shall examine the emissions data referred to in section 5 subsections (1) and (2) of this Act and shall present the Federal Government and the Bundestag with an assessment of the published data within one month following their transmission by the Federal Environment Agency.

In addition, the Bundestag or the Federal Government may, through adoption of corresponding decisions, task the Council of Experts on Climate Change with drawing up special reports.

Mandate

(1) The Council of Experts on Climate Change shall examine the emissions data referred to in section 5 subsections (1) and (2) of this Act and shall present the Federal Government and the Bundestag with an assessment of the published data within one month following their transmission by the Federal Environment Agency.

(2) Before the proposal for a decision on the measures referred to in section 8 subsection (2) is produced, the Council of Experts on Climate Change shall examine the assumptions on greenhouse gas reduction that underlie the measures.

(3) The Federal Government shall obtain the opinion of the Council of Experts on Climate Change regarding the underlying assumptions on greenhouse gas reduction before ordering the implementation of the following measures:

1. alterations to the annual emission budgets by means of a statutory instrument enacted under
2. section 4 subsection (5) of this Act;
3. updating of the Climate Action Plan;
4. adoption of climate action programmes pursuant to section 9.

In addition, the Bundestag or the Federal Government may, through adoption of corresponding decisions, task the Council of Experts on Climate Change with drawing up special reports.

(4) All public bodies of the Federation within the meaning of section 2 subsection (1) of the Federal Data Protection Act (Bundesdatenschutzgesetz) shall enable the Council of Experts on Climate Change to peruse the data required for the performance of its tasks and shall make such data available. The Federal Government shall ensure that the protection of third parties' industrial and commercial secrets and of personal data is guaranteed. The Council of Experts on Climate Change may hear and question public authorities as well as experts, particularly representatives of business organisations and environmental associations, on matters relating to climate action.

[⏪ Return to top](#)

Denmark

Independence

10. The Danish Council on Climate Change is an independent advisory body of experts.

Expertise Requirement

(3). The Danish Council on Climate Change is composed of experts with broad expertise and high level of climate-relevant academic knowledge relating to energy, buildings, transport, agriculture, environment, nature, economics, climate science research, and behavioural research of relevance to the climate field.

Membership

(2). The Danish Council on Climate Change consists of 1 chair and 8 other members. The Danish Council on Climate Change elects 1 candidate for each vacant post, who is subsequently appointed by the Minister for Climate, Energy and Utilities.

[...]

(4). Two of the Climate Council's other members will be appointed as deputy chairs.

(5). The chair and the deputy chairs speak on behalf of the Climate Council.

(6). The members of The Danish Council on Climate Change are appointed for a four-year term. Members may be reappointed once. If the chair or one of the other members resigns from the Council before the expiry of the term, a new member may be appointed for less than four years in accordance with the procedure outlined in paragraph 2.

Secretariat and Budget

11. The Danish Council on Climate Change is assisted by a secretariat.

(2). The secretariat is headed by a head of secretariat, who is appointed by the chair of The Danish Council on Climate Change.

Internal Rules

(7). The Danish Council on Climate Change determines its rules of procedure.

Reporting

4. The Danish Council on Climate Change must annually make recommendations to the Minister for Climate, Energy and Utilities on the climate effort. In the recommendations, The Danish Council on Climate Change must observe the principles stated in Article 1(3).

(2). In the recommendations, The Danish Council on Climate Change must also assess whether the government's climate efforts make it probable that the climate targets, as referred to in Articles 1(1) and 2(1), will be reached.

(3). In connection with the recommendations, The Danish Council on Climate Change must provide a status update on Denmark's international targets.

5. The Danish Council on Climate Change must comment on the annual climate status and projection, as referred to in Article 6, and the Minister of Climate, Energy and Utilities' annual climate programme, as referred to in Articles 7(1) and 7(2).

(2). The Danish Council on Climate Change must prepare a catalogue of potential measures.

(3). The Danish Council on Climate Change must contribute to the public debate.

(4). The Danish Council on Climate Change may prepare analyses of, and recommendations on, the climate effort, etc.

[⏪ Return to top](#)

California

Independence

(a) The Independent Emissions Market Advisory Committee is hereby established within the California Environmental Protection Agency.

Expertise Requirement

(b)(1)(A) The committee shall be composed of at least five experts on emissions trading market design [...]

(2) The committee members shall meet all of the following requirements:

- A. Have academic, nonprofit, and other relevant backgrounds.
- B. Lack financial conflicts of interest with entities subject to the regulation adopted by the state board pursuant to subdivision (c) of Section 38562 .

Membership

(b)(1)(A) The committee shall be composed of at least five experts on emissions trading market design appointed according to the following:

- i. Three members appointed by the Governor.
- ii. One member appointed by the Senate Committee on Rules.
- iii. One member appointed by the Speaker of the Assembly.

(B) The committee shall include a representative from the Legislative Analyst's Office.

Reporting

(c) The committee, at least annually, shall hold a public meeting and report to both the state board and the Joint Legislative Committee on Climate Change Policies on the environmental and economic performance of the regulation adopted by the state board pursuant to subdivision (c) of Section 38562 and other relevant climate policies.

Mandate

*The committee dissolves at the beginning of 2031: “(d) This section shall remain in effect only until January 1, 2031, and as of that date is repealed.”

[⏪ Return to top](#)

Quebec

Independence

The members must be independent, that is, they must have no relationships or interests that could interfere with the pursuit of the committee's mission.

The committee acts with full independence in accordance with this division.

Expertise Requirement

The members must collectively have significant and multidisciplinary expertise and experience regarding the fight against climate change and the majority must be from the scientific community.

Membership

15.0.2. The Government appoints the committee chair after consulting the chief scientist appointed under section 26 of the Act respecting the Ministère de l'Enseignement supérieur, de la Recherche, de la Science et de la Technologie (chapter M-15.1.0.1).

The Minister then appoints the other committee members he chooses from among the persons appearing on a list jointly established by the committee chair and the chief scientist.

15.0.5. The committee members are appointed for a term of up to three years.

At the expiry of their term, they remain in office until reappointed or replaced.

15.0.7. The committee members receive no remuneration except in the cases, on the conditions and to the extent the Government may determine.

Secretariat and Budget

15.0.10. The secretary and the other personnel members of the committee are appointed in accordance with the Public Service Act (chapter F-3.1.1).

15.0.11. The resources the Minister considers necessary for the accomplishment of the committee's mission, to ensure administrative support and the organization of its work, are made available to it.

Internal Rules

15.0.8. The committee may make any by-law concerning the exercise of its functions and its internal management.

15.0.9. The quorum at committee meetings is a majority of the voting members.

The committee's advice and by-laws are adopted by a majority of the members present.

Reporting

15.0.3. The mission of the committee is to advise the Minister, at the latter's request or on its own initiative, on the policy directions, programs, policies and strategies regarding the fight against climate change, taking into consideration advances in science and technology as well as scientific consensus in this area.

The Minister may request a department or body to provide him, within the time he specifies, with any information or document necessary for the pursuit of the committee's mission. The Minister then sends the information or document obtained to the committee.

15.0.4. The committee makes its advice to the Minister public 30 days after sending it to the Minister.

Mandate

15.0.3. The mission of the committee is to advise the Minister, at the latter's request or on its own initiative, on the policy directions, programs, policies and strategies regarding the fight against climate change, taking into consideration advances in science and technology as well as scientific consensus in this area.

[⤴ Return to top](#)